MICHHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY ADAPP-ADVANCE YEAR FOUR, QUARTER TWO – REPORT 3.1.12

The ADAPP-ADVANCE project continues to refine initiatives, policies and practices. In YR4, MSU has turned its focus to: 1) evaluation of the impact of initiatives and revised practices and policies; 2) development of structures and institutionalization of activities and practices evaluated as important and effective in reaching the goals of the project; and 3) initiation of research projects to better understand the impact of policies and practices on the recruitment, retention and advancement of women in STEM disciplines.

INSTITUTIONALIZATION – STRUCTURES, PROCESSES AND PROGRAMS

INSTITUTIONALIZATION OF THE FEA NETWORK

- On February 3, 2012 the FEA Consortium, the expanded group of Faculty Excellence Advocates at Michigan State University, met and discussed their evolving roles in each college. Input was given to co-PI and Associate Provost for Academic Human Resources, Terry Curry, about what educational and/or political support was needed in each college to maximize impact of the FEA on diversity and inclusion in each college-specific context. The next formal FEA meeting will occur in April and the discussion will focus on faculty search. In the meantime, FEAs were provided with resources relating to building their understanding of implicit bias.

INSTITUTIONALIZATION OF POLICY

- Institutionalization of FEA Role
  - Director Melissa McDaniels, co-PI Terry Curry and Provost Budget Officer Corinne Reardon met on December 13, 2012 to identify and start to answer a set of policy questions related to institutionalizing the FEA role at the university. The FEAs will report to both the college dean and the Provost; therefore, the Provost will require some accountability and quality controls regarding how FEAs are selected, evaluated, and carry out their roles, regardless of college.

- Institutionalization of Mentoring Policy
  - Co-PI Terry Curry requested copies of the mentoring policy from each of the 17 academic colleges at Michigan State University. These were submitted on December 1. Director McDaniels and Graduate Assistant Jimenez are working with co-PI Curry and Sarah Woodruff, external and internal evaluator, to develop a rubric that FEAs can use to assess their college’s policies for formative purposes.

INSTITUTIONALIZING PROJECT MOMENTUM

- As described in our last quarterly report, the Institutionalization Action Group (IAG) was formed to replace the ADAPP-ADVANCE Administrative Coordinating Team (ACT) and will be responsible for institutionalization of the best practices initiated by the ADAPP-ADVANCE project. The newly formed group includes: Associate Provost for Academic Human Resources; Director of Planning;
INSTITUTIONALIZING METHODS FOR COLLECTING AND USING FACULTY ACCOMPLISHMENTS DATA

The Faculty Information Tool (FIT) Development Team has made significant progress in the last three months. On January 23, 2012, the Team presented a business model and timeline for the development of FIT to the Provost, Associate Provost for Academic Human Resources, Director of Planning and Budgets, and Vice President for Research and Graduate Studies (see attached). The meeting resulted in approval to develop and distribute a Request for Applications (RFA) to vendors (both commercial and open source systems) requesting solutions that would best meet the specifications for a Faculty Information Tool at MSU. We anticipate that the RFA will be completed and distributed in early May. The applications received will be reviewed by the Development Team in mid-summer, and a recommendation will be presented to the University’s senior administrators in August 2012 for the licensing of a software product that would best connect to current university central databases and maintain faculty professional activities and accomplishments.

In addition, in December, 2011 the FIT Development Team finalized a three year license with Elsevier for the implementation of SciVal Experts and SciVal Funding modules, which will be part of the FIT portfolio. The SciVal Experts module will provide a download of faculty publications from the Scopus database to be included as part of faculty’s data on professional accomplishments. The FIT team is in the process of implementing the modules and developing training materials for faculty to use the SciVal systems.

And finally, the FIT Development Team is exploring Academic Analytics, which may also be a component of the FIT portfolio. Three members of the Development Team will be attending an Academic Analytics workshop in March to learn more about the system and to determine if this product could augment the FIT portfolio.

INSTITUTIONALIZING ACCOUNTABILITY STRUCTURES - INTEGRATION WITH ACADEMIC PLANNING PROCESS

MSU has achieved major successes over the last three years as we have worked to control and shape our own future. Our multi-year financial planning enabled the university to weather the 2011-12 15% reductions in State appropriations. Our two-year planning horizon allowed the university a longer time to manage changes in the State’s economic climate.

The shared sacrifices of MSU faculty and staff have enabled the university to move forward with strategic investments and to make financial choices that leverage our strengths:

- Keeping an MSU education affordable by robust growth in need-based financial aid;
- Continuing to recruit and retain top faculty;
- Contributing to the recovery of the Michigan economy through provision of an educated workforce, research, and partnerships sharing University expertise across the state;
• Continuing our leadership in how we use experiences outside the classroom to reinforce higher learning through innovative living-learning models and experiential learning opportunities;
• Recognizing the critical contribution external research funding plays in our success and reputation and making investments accordingly.

The academic planning process is a multi-year cycle of a fall discussion focused on strategic plans of units, followed by a spring meeting about budget requests that align with unit strategic direction and identify what is needed to execute its plan and to connect it with the University’s overall strategic direction.

For the fall 2011 academic planning process, units were asked to update their strategic directions for the first stage of the planning cycle by providing an integrated planning document that included both the unit’s strategic plans, along with a budget request that supports implementation of unit plans. Strategic planning documents are expected to include how each unit accomplishes the following:

1. Establishes or reaffirms a programmatic vision that is sustainable and at the same time dynamic and responsive to strategic opportunities.
2. Focuses priorities and effort.
3. Supports or aligns with broader university college initiatives
4. Defines and uses metrics to demonstrate results and accountability.
5. Commits internal funds as well as requested funds to new efforts or initiatives, as appropriate.

MSU’s commitment to inclusion and diversity is a hallmark value of the institution. It is important that college and unit-level policies and practices are aligned with MSU’s values of quality and inclusion and that there are effective structures in place to facilitate and promote the commitment to achieving excellence with diversity.

As a direct outcome of the ADAPP/ADVANCE NSF grant, we intentionally prioritized progress on diversity as an accountability metric and incentivized the focus on diversity by allocating additional funding in 2011-12 to those colleges which had made measurable strides in enhancing diversity (approximately 1% of our annual recurring allocation budget-$400,000.) Seven colleges were awarded incentive funding of $50,000-$100,000 each in summer 2011 in recognition of their progress on six key diversity metrics (Attachment XX).

To institutionalize university accountability for diversity and to refine our internal set of metrics, for the fall 2011 planning process, each college was reviewed for some common indicators of success, including the number of underrepresented faculty members within each college, and their distribution across ranks. Colleges were asked to identify and describe additional plans and indicators that will bring/have brought results for improving diversity with timelines and specific initiatives for diversifying the faculty. In addition, they were asked to highlight any programmatic initiatives that were emblematic of progress on diversity across the college and what quantifiable impact they have had.

Also this fall, the Provost and the IAG group, along with deans, worked to clarify the role of the Faculty Excellence Advocate (FEA), recognizing that different colleges might have different structures reflecting their individual cultures and strategic approaches to diversifying the faculty. As part of the planning and budgeting process, each college dean was asked to discuss the role of the FEA, his/her expectations for them in the coming year, and how their success and impact, and thereby that of the college, would be measured in this effort.
ACHIEVEMENTS BY PROJECT GOAL

GOAL 1: INCREASE THE RECRUITMENT OF WOMEN FACULTY

CROSS-COLLEGE / GMT ACTIVITY

- On April 27, Paulette Granberry Russell and Mark Roehling will be running a faculty search workshop for FEAs from all 17 colleges. Planning for that effort is now underway.

- A faculty search toolkit is now being developed and will be ready by the April meeting.

COLLEGE ACTIVITY

- FEA Susan Conrad and Associate Dean Chivukula have continued to work with 12 ongoing faculty searches in the college. In addition to attending initial search committee meetings and distributing information on “best practices” they have provided feedback to committees on search criteria and procedures, and on final interview lists (College of Natural Science).

- Provided support and guidance as History began the process of hiring a faculty member in the African-American History program. Diverse pools of candidates were invited for interviews that included three African-American women and one African-American male. Two offers are being made to African-American women; one offer has been accepted and another offer will go out shortly (College of Social Science).

- DeBrenna Agbényiga (Associate Dean for Graduate Studies & Inclusion and FEA) and Pamela Gray continued to follow-up with the Director of the School of Human Resources and Labor Relations after the discussion during the last quarter relating to diversity, inclusion, position allocation and the search process that supports a diverse faculty. This has led to an offer being presented and accepted by top-ranked African-American female faculty member (College of Social Science).

- Finalizing the revision of the faculty feedback form that is used by the Dean’s Office to evaluate potential faculty (College of Social Science).

- Preliminary planning for aspects needed for inclusion in a College-wide training of committee chairs and others engaged in the search process that will clarify roles and expectations (College of Social Science).

- The FEA continued to attend various LEAD seminars relating to recruitment, retention and mentoring of faculty (College of Social Science).
GOALS 2 & 3: INCREASED RETENTION AND ADVANCEMENT OF WOMEN FACULTY

CROSS-COLLEGE / GMT ACTIVITY

- We put our mentoring toolkit on-line (http://www.adapp.advance.msu.edu/Faculty-Mentoring-Toolkit)

- We developed a new resource on parenting and caregiving (http://www.adapp.advance.msu.edu/parenting-caregiving-resources-faculty).

COLLEGE ACTIVITY

- A group composed of six faculty members was formed as a "mentoring workgroup" which is working with the FEA to evaluate our College's faculty mentoring programs. The group is looking into mechanisms to formally assess our mentoring programs, define good mentoring practices that may address challenges unique to College of Engineering faculty, and look into new opportunities to enhance our mentoring approaches (Engineering).

- As reported previously, the mentoring workgroup held focus group meetings with all of our pre-tenure faculty to get their direct input on strengths and weaknesses of our current mentoring efforts in the College. The collected information is being analyzed to define the elements that need improvement. Additionally this information will be provided to Dr. Sarah Woodruff for formal analysis by Ohio’s Evaluation and Assessment Center for Mathematics and Science Education and Discovery Center (Engineering).

- DeBrenna Agbényiga (Associate Dean for Graduate Studies & Inclusion and FEA) is overseeing a new college committee charged with designing guidelines for the annual review process. The primary focus of the committee will be to provide uniformity of standards for annual review across the schools and units. The committee consists of Chairs/Directors from various units in the College (College of Social Science).

- Chris Maxwell (Associate Dean for Research) is overseeing a new college committee charged with providing guidelines for obtaining external letters as a part of the RPT process. The primary focus of this committee is to ensure uniformity of standards in selection of external evaluators and content of evaluators’ letters. The committee consists of Chairs/Directors from various units in the College, a member of the college Research Committee, and a member of the Dean’s Advisory Reappointment, Promotion and Tenure (DARPT) Committee (College of Social Science).

- Dean Baba, DeBrenna Agbényiga (Associate Dean for Graduate Studies & Inclusion and FEA), Bob Caldwell (former FEA team member) and Psychology Chair Juli Wade met with the Ohio Evaluation & Assessment Center (OEAC) leader, Sarah Woodruff to discuss the progress of the pilot mentoring programs and the current evaluation plan (College of Social Science).

- All units submitted their mentoring program plan in accordance with the College's approved mentor policy.

- The Dean’s office is in the process of reviewing all of the units’ mentoring programs and providing feedback for necessary changes (College of Social Science).
• Dean Baba, DeBrenna Agbényiga (Associate Dean for Graduate Studies & Inclusion and FEA), and Chris Maxwell (Associate Dean for Research) worked as a team to review files for reappointment, tenure and promotion. The group conducted an extra assessment of all cases that did not receive a favorable recommendation from the DARPT Committee. Upon completion of the analysis, the team met with the Associate Provost for Academic Human Resources to discuss proposed options (College of Social Science).

• Dean Baba, DeBrenna Agbényiga (Associate Dean for Graduate Studies & Inclusion and FEA), and Chris Maxwell (Associate Dean for Research) served on a panel to address faculty who were recently reappointed along with their unit leader. The session included a review of the College’s RPT process and direction for productive and protocol for submitting their tenure dossier (College of Social Science).

• Dean Baba, Chris Maxwell (Associate Dean for Research) and Michelle Strobel met with the department Chairs who attended the recently reappointed faculty meeting to gain feedback for future meetings and to discuss ways to enhance sponsored research in college units (College of Social Science).

• A survey has been sent to faculty who participated in the reappointment meeting to obtain their feedback for improvement (College of Social Science).

• Dean Baba and DeBrenna Agbényiga (FEA) met with Jodie Linley to discuss the next phase for meeting with women in the College with a focus on leadership (College of Social Science).

• The College’s Women in Leadership luncheon will be held on April 9, 2012 at the Kellogg Conference Center. The luncheon will include a distinguish panel of women leaders in the College. They will discuss the path to leadership and provide guidance to assist women in the process of moving from faculty to different levels of leadership (College of Social Science).

• We continue to develop, implement and assess the pilot mentoring demonstration projects in the Department of Psychology and the School of Social Work (College of Social Science).

• Chairs were asked to submit copies of annual review evaluations for all tenure track assistant and associate professors, which were reviewed by Dean Kirkpatrick and Associate Dean Chivukula (Natural Science)

• We have begun planning for the evaluation of the department mentoring programs that were instituted in Fall 2011. As an initial step, a questionnaire is being prepared for distribution to junior faculty. In addition, the topic of mentoring will be discussed in a meeting with junior faculty to be held in April (Natural Science)

• A “Teaching Essentials” workshop on "Active Learning" was held in February (Natural Science)

• A questionnaire is being prepared for junior faculty to determine what professional development opportunities they are currently taking advantage of, or would like to see offered. These issues will be also be discussed at a meeting with junior faculty in April (Natural Science).
GOAL 4: IMPROVE WORKPLACE CLIMATE

COLLEGE ACTIVITY

- We have created a Worklife at Engineering website (http://www.egr.msu.edu/WE) that is being referenced in our faculty recruitment announcements. It contains information on how MSU supports some of the most pressing issues our faculty recruits typically would like to know about.

- At a meeting with women faculty in CNS last fall, one issue that was raised was the difficulty finding information about childcare options. In response to this, ADAPP put together a website on Parenting and Caregiving Resources for Faculty. In addition, a section on worklife balance and family resources has been added to the CNS website (http://ns.msu.edu/index.php/faculty/worklife-balance-and-family-resources/).

- The dean’s office is in the process of conducting a review of the units’ mentoring programs to ensure that they are inclusive and supportive of faculty success (College of Social Science).

- DeBrenna Agbényiga (Associate Dean for Graduate Studies & Inclusion and FEA) held individual meetings with female faculty to discuss the RPT process and structure in the College (College of Social Science).

- Dean Baba and DeBrenna Agbényiga have had discussions about the mentoring pilots and how some best practices might be implemented in other units (College of Social Science).

- Dean Baba made official offers to Chairs/Directors to engage the FEA to come to their units and discuss the role of diversity, inclusion, position allocation and the search process that supports a diverse faculty (College of Social Science).

- Dean Baba and DeBrenna Agbényiga provide biweekly or monthly updates on ADAPP at the Chairs/Directors meetings that are held bi-weekly (College of Social Science).

GOALS 1-4: CROSS-CUTTING CONTRIBUTIONS / OTHER

- Dr. Daina Briedis, Professor of Chemical Engineering and Materials Science, has accepted a half-time appointment as Assistant Dean for Student Advancement and Program Assessment. In this leadership role, she will lead the College’s efforts in: development of initiatives to more directly engage our high achieving students and developing new initiatives related to academic and service learning; and college assessment and quality improvement efforts, ranging from the cornerstone and residential programs, to ABET accreditation, to other college activities. She will also represent the Associate Dean for Undergraduate Studies in all matters in his absence (Engineering).
• DeBrenna Agbényiga was promoted to Associate Dean for Graduate Studies and Inclusion which enhances the visibility and support for the FEA role (College of Social Science).

• The College changed their FEA model from a team approach to assigning the newly appointed Associate Dean for Graduate Studies and Inclusion as the only FEA (College of Social Science).

• Dean Baba and DeBrenna Agbényiga met to discuss the role of the FEA and submitted a final copy of the CSS FEA job description to the Associate Provost for Academic Human Resources (College of Social Science).

• Clarified the role of the CSS FEA in the RPT process; the FEA now is included in all RPT activities (College of Social Science).

• A survey is being conducted by Neal Schmitt to assess faculty research capacity and support structures in CSS. It is believed that the findings from the survey will provide insight into the needs of faculty in relation to research and scholarship that will support faculty development and advancement through the RPT process (College of Social Science).

EVALUATION

• A team from the Ohio Center for the Evaluation and Assessment of Mathematics and Science Education visited East Lansing on 2/20 and 2/21.

• An evaluation plan has been revised and a timeline for the rest of YR4 and YR5 produced (Attachment XX)

• Boutique reports (formative report to be ‘user friendly’ to deans) have been drafted. Input is being sought from grant team prior to distribution to the Deans.

• Annual Review & RP&T chair inventory was re-deployed. Analysis is currently under way.

• College case studies (including both policy & FEA role analysis) are in process. Faculty members and chairs to be interviewed about perceptions of FEA role in the spring.

• Regression/Retention Model to be completed for March College Academic Planning Meetings

• Mentoring case study in Department of Psychology has been completed. The Social Work case study is in process (College of Social Science).

• A rubric to enable colleges to use that will enhance their mentoring programs is being developed.

• Members of faculty search committees for 2011-2012 to be interviewed in Colleges of Engineering and Natural Science (about Curry intervention).
Op-ed or pitch for article in either the *Chronicle of Higher Education* or *Inside Higher Education*.
- **Purpose**: promote MSU’s strategy, approach, outcomes, and lessons learned related to addressing issues of inclusive excellence in the faculty workplace
- **Audience**: opinion leaders, senior administrators
- **Author**: Kim Wilcox (drafted by Roehling, Curry, McDaniels, Granberry Russell)
- Collaborate with Cathy Burns and University Relations / Media Communications; talk to Elizabeth Simmons about contacts at Inside Higher Education (she is a blogger here)

**Scholarly Article** (outlet TBA)
- **Working Title**: Advancing Faculty Inclusion and Excellence: An Examination of Faculty Socialization Tactic toward and Perceptions of Institutional Embeddedness among Underrepresented Faculty of Color
- **Authors**: Isis Settles, PhD, Associate Professor, Dept. of Psychology; Paulette Granberry Russell, J.D. Dir. Office for Inclusion; Gregory Larnell, PhD, Assistant Professor, Department of Curriculum and Instruction, University of Illinois, Chicago

**Article for Change: The Magazine for Higher Learning**
- **Working Title**: Ingress into leadership: The important role of disciplinary societies
- **Purpose**: Utilize data from ADAPP disciplinary leadership survey, focus groups with faculty leaders and literature to argue that assuming disciplinary leadership roles can be helpful to faculty interested in eventually pursuing titled roles on campuses.
- **Audience**: Senior administrators, faculty, faculty developers, opinion leaders in disciplines
- **Author**: Melissa McDaniels, Tamara Reid Bush, Karen Klomparens
- Utilize this publication as a springboard for op-ed pieces in disciplinary outlets/website like AAAS, others.

**Scholarly Article for Human Resource Management Review**
- **Working Title**: Aligning employment policies and practices with the diversity and inclusivity values: A conceptual model and future research directions.
- **Authors**: Roehling, M.V., Ericksen, J., and McDaniels, M.

**Scholarly Article for Group and Organization Management**
- **Working Title**: Gender differences in leadership self-efficacy and perceived support and their influence on the willingness to lead.
- **Authors**: Roehling, M.V., McDaniels, M., & Hmurovic, J.
Scholarly article for *Academic Medicine, Family Medicine, Medical Education*, or *American Family Physician*.

- **Working Title:** Advancing Diversity and Inclusion in Academic Medicine
- **Authors:** Luz, C. and Reid Bush, T.

### RESEARCH STUDIES IN PROGRESS

**Advancing Faculty Inclusion and Excellence: An Examination of Faculty Socialization Tactics toward and Perceptions of Institutional Embeddedness among Underrepresented Faculty of Color**

- **Investigators:** Isis Settles, PhD, Associate Professor, Dept. of Psychology; Paulette Granberry Russell, J.D. Dir. Office for Inclusion; Gregory Larnell, PhD, Assistant Professor, Department of Curriculum and Instruction, University of Illinois, Chicago

- **Purpose:**
The purpose of this project is to empirically examine the academic career experiences of tenure-system faculty members at Michigan State University. The project represents a new (if not next) step among a sequence of institution-wide attempts to gauge the academic work environment for faculty and/or staff. In particular, those efforts include studies of academic human resource policies and practices, climate and culture, and the academic work experiences of women faculty members and faculty members from historically underrepresented racial/ethnic (or “ethnoracial”

2) groups. The present study is subtly distinct from its predecessors, however, in that it instead aims to combine several foci of those previous studies. To that end, the project centers on *faculty socialization* (Austin, 2002; Gruman, Saks, & Zweig, 2006; Jones, 1986; Schrodt, Cawyer, & Sanders, 2003; Tierney, 1997; Tierney & Rhoads, 1994) together with perceptions of institutional and community *embeddedness* (Allen, 2006; Cable & Parsons, 2001; Halbesleben & Wheeler, 2008; Holton, Mitchell, & Lee, 2006; Mitchell, Holton, Lee, Sablynski, & Erez, 2001)—as they are experienced and reported by tenure-system faculty members from four historically and domestically underrepresented, ethnoracial groups in the United States: African Americans, Asian Americans, Latina/o Americans, and Native Americans.

- **Research Questions:**
  - How do faculty members of color experience institutional socialization processes?
  - How do faculty members of color perceive embeddedness within the institution and community?
  - Do socialization experiences relate to perceptions of embeddedness among faculty of color?
Do women of color, in particular, experience faculty socialization tactics and perceive embeddedness in ways that differ from men of color?

**Status:**
- Interview protocol completed
- Interviewers tentatively identified
- URM informational email drafted and to be distributed to faculty that will be asked to participate in the study
- URM consent form completed and to be distributed
- Interviewer instructions drafted and being finalized for IRB submission (include: how to schedule the interviews and procedures for the actual interview session)

**Analysis of research funding of STEM faculty as measured by grants, contracts and IP development.**

- **Investigators:** Estelle McGroarty & Karen Patricia Williams
- **Research Questions:**
  - Do women submit similar numbers of grants, are they as successful.
  - Are women as active as men in IP development and in obtaining patents?
  - Are gender differences seen at all ranks and years in rank?
  - Does participation on multi investigator impact success, is there a greater success rate for multi vs. single investigator grants, for single investigator grant by women vs. men.
- **Status:**
  - IRB completed
  - Database being cleaned
  - Meeting with C&G scheduled

**OTHER DISSEMINATION**

Grant Management Team member Paulette Granberry Russell received an invitation to speak at a one-day mini-conference entitled “The Keys to Academics’ Success: Policies and Practices”. This conference is being hosted by the LEADER Consortium, an NSF partnership among four institutions (Air Force Institute of Technology, Central State University, University of Dayton, and Wright State University).

Director Melissa McDaniels met with Dr. Mary Deane Sorcinelli at UMASS-Amherst to discuss MSU’s approach to supporting faculty mentoring and to gather ideas related to the assessment of mentoring.

Director Melissa McDaniels met with Dr. Donna Qualters (Tufts University) and Dr. Lily Hsu (Massachusetts College of Pharmacy) and shared MSU’s mentoring toolkit with them.

Both Jodi Linley (ADAPP-ADVANCE Graduate Assistant) and Melissa McDaniels were notified that their posters/papers have been accepted to be presented at the WEPAN conference in Columbus, Ohio in June 2012.